NQT Quality Improvement Study for the Training and Development Agency for Schools

Literature review conducted for Part 1 of the study, December 2007 - February 2008

Executive summary of the literature review

Publications suggest that for teachers in general:

- too few graduates are entering or staying in teaching;
- this is affecting secondary more than primary schools and certain subject areas more than others (e.g. physics, chemistry, maths);
- it is exacerbated by the anticipated retirement of many current teachers in the next 15-20 years;
- the pattern is subject to regional variation in intensity and focus (e.g. demand for teachers in the East and South East; issues are more intense in London).

There are similar concerns in many other countries. Approaches to deal with them have common features, they: emphasise teacher quality rather than quantity; focus on teacher development, performance and school needs; are more flexible in teacher training; give schools more responsibility for personnel management. UK policy initiatives reflect these features, e.g.: new initial teacher training (ITT) routes; fast track promotion schemes.

Publications indicate the following in relation to NQTs.

- Career choices Commonly, reasons for choosing teaching are altruistic and relate to intrinsic features of the job; reasons for not choosing it relate to pay, stress, management and pupil behaviour.
- ITT and the quality of NQTs.
 ITT courses may be too short to equip teachers for the classroom and there are gaps in provision, e.g. NQTs have issues in dealing with parents and handling difficult classroom behaviour. Trends are towards PGCEs rather than undergraduate courses and to school (employment) based ITT. Opinion is divided on the benefits of the latter.
 In one study most NQTs had worked in supply after ITT, seen as positive for schools and NQTs. Subject knowledge may be a weakness in NQTs.
- The recruitment of NQTs
 There are regional variations; in some areas NQTs find it difficult to find jobs and in others
 there is a growing demand for teachers. Geographical location of posts is important for
 NQTs, with difficulties in securing jobs relating to vacancy availability in desired locations
 (exacerbating difficulties for mature NQTs). The number of temporary contracts is
 increasing, because of budgetary constraints, with secondary NQTs more likely to secure an
 initial permanent post than primary. Disadvantaged schools are more likely to have
 difficulties in recruiting NQTs. Teachers tend to gravitate towards the type of school they
 attended (mainly related to socio-economic factors). NQTs often obtain posts in schools
 where they have been on placement.

• The retention of NQTs

Problems in retaining teachers affect secondary schools more than primary schools. More advantaged schools have better retention of teachers. Often teachers do not leave teaching permanently but move in and out of it. Some teachers move from the state to the private sector. Common reasons for leaving the profession are workload and pupil discipline, with financial issues (salary, housing costs etc) more problematic in London than other areas. The perceived status of teachers, the subjects they teach and their schools impact on retention. More teachers are leaving because they are on short term contracts.

The induction of NQTs
 There may be a relationship between induction experiences and intention to stay in
 teaching. One study found that 88% of NQTs had a formal induction programme but there
 are concerns about the variable quality of induction (e.g. issues include time allowance,
 expertise of mentors, being valued). NQTs may be afraid to speak negatively about their
 induction, especially if on temporary contracts. NQTs would welcome more support in
 addition to their induction, e.g. from ITT providers. The Career Entry Development Profile
 (CEDP) is not always used effectively and may not provide a positive basis for future CPD.

Review of the existing literature on NQTs

1 Aims

The literature review was conducted between November 2007 and February 2008. Given the nature of the study and the timescale for the review, a comprehensive systematic consideration of all issues relating to newly qualified teachers (NQTs) was not possible, so the research team concentrated on the core issues of recruitment and retention. The review aimed to consider:

- problem areas with relation to NQT recruitment and retention for further exploration;
- the effectiveness of NQT recruitment;
- the effectiveness of NQT retention;
- the impact of internal and external factors on the recruitment and retention of NQTs.

Key policy documents were identified and databases searched for items relating to the issues in question. The review covered a range of types of publication: books, chapters, journal articles, research reports, statistical data, conference papers and press articles. It aimed to garner a general and broad understanding of issues pertinent to NQT recruitment and retention and identify the existing supporting evidence.

The literature search began with visits to the websites of some of the main organisations relevant to NQT issues: the TDA; the British Educational Communications and Technology Agency (BECTA); Teachernet; the Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF). These provided links to key publications and research studies about NQTs. Other online searches included the sites of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the Times Educational Supplement (TES), Education-line, and Google Scholar. Additionally two educational databases, ERIC (Educational Resources Information Centre) and BIDS (Bath Information and Data Services), were consulted.

Items identified were accepted or rejected for further analysis on the basis of pertinence to the literature review aims. This process involved checking titles and abstracts for keywords and phrases, date of publication and relevance in relation to location (the study is concerned with England). The items to be reviewed were distributed between members of the research team. Each item reviewed was recorded systematically, all documentation was stored on a drive shared between members of the research team and regularly updated and PDFs of relevant articles could also be stored and accessed by any team member. The annotated bibliographies were analysed to provide the following summary.

2 Overview

2.1 Introduction

A key source of teacher recruitment statistics is Education Data Surveys. This has historical data on teacher recruitment dating back to the 1980's and is regularly cited in press and governmental publications. One finding from the literature review was that there is very little systematic or comprehensive understanding of the broad picture. Many studies about NQT recruitment and retention are qualitative, encompassing small and specific groups of NQTs or teachers and particular situations and localities: for example, secondary modern language NQTs who studied for a PGCE at the University of Nottingham within a five year period (Smethem, 2007). A major, recent quantitative report is of research conducted by Hobson et al (2007) at the Universities of Nottingham and Leeds, on behalf of the DCSF and TDA, entitled *Newly Qualified Teachers' Experiences of their First Year of Teaching*.

There was a general consensus that there is a serious teacher recruitment and retention problem in England (and Wales). Publications suggest that:

- too few graduates are entering or staying in teaching;
- this is a problem affecting secondary more than primary schools;
- the problem is affecting certain subject areas more than others (although all have a problem to some degree);
- it is exacerbated by the anticipated retirement of a large proportion of current teachers in the next 15-20 years;
- the pattern is subject to regional variation in intensity and focus.

2.2 Global perspective

Although this study is concerned with England, it is worth noting that the problem is more widespread. Darling-Hammond (1999) states that in the US at least 30% of teachers are leaving the career within 5 years of entering (cited in Smethem, 2007), whilst Parkinson (2005) gives this figure as leaving within 2 years. The Organisation for Economic Co-operative Development (OECD) *Teachers Matter* review outlines key concerns across 25 counties in relation to teacher recruitment and retention, which include:

- the attractiveness of a teaching career, particularly for high-demand subject areas, in the face of the undervaluing of teaching as a profession and relatively declining salaries;
- developing the knowledge and skills of teachers to meet schools needs;
- the inequitable distribution of teachers amongst schools, with schools in disadvantaged areas particularly struggling to recruit, select and employ teachers;
- teachers leaving the profession as a result of stress, high workloads, poor working environments and lack of reward or recognition (OECD, 2005).

These are similar issues to those faced by schools in England. All countries facing such problems are attempting to tackle them at national level, using a variety of approaches, such as:

- placing an emphasis on quality of teachers rather than quantity;
- tailoring teacher profiles to development, performance and school needs;
- viewing teacher development as a continuum;

- increasing flexibility in teacher training;
- allowing schools more responsibility for teacher personnel management (OECD, 2005).

2.3 The extent of the problem

Wilson's (2005) study of post-16 recruitment and retention of teachers in Further Education (FE) showed that recruitment remains a problem in FE, most prominently in core subject areas (English, maths and science). However, the majority of FE teachers responding had over 10 years experience in the sector and expressed high levels of satisfaction, with only one quarter feeling undervalued (Wilson, 2005). This implies that retention issues in FE are less problematic than in schools, where the evidence suggests that there have been difficulties in providing properly qualified teachers since the early 1990s (Barmby, 2006).

2.4 Policy reactions to the problem

Birks (2000) outlines some of the multitude of moves taken to tackle the problems of NQT recruitment and retention, in particular the emergence of a range of new routes into teaching (School Centred Initial Teacher Training, SCITTs; Graduate Teacher routes; Registered Teacher routes) and other initiatives such as governmental support for key workers in purchasing housing and having Local Authority Recruitment Strategy Managers. One initiative to encourage high level graduates to move into teaching is the Fast Track scheme, offering rapid movement up the career ladder, which Tranter (2003) critiques as less sensitive than talent spotting schemes used in the private sector. A study by the University of York suggests that the most effective way of recruiting and retaining teachers may be through offering an enjoyable, intellectually rewarding job, with manageable stress levels, a pleasant environment and congenial and creative colleagues (Birks, 2000). This may be more persuasive for undecided graduates than offers of high earnings, fast tracks to management and a constantly changing environment.

2.5 Across the country

Milne's (2007) article in the TES (17.8.07) used data from Educational Data Surveys to outline key differences in patterns relating to the secondary teacher workforce and recruitment across the country. Despite severe shortages of teachers in some subjects (physics, chemistry and mathematics) and growing demand for teachers in certain parts of the country (particularly the East and South East), this is not the case everywhere. In the North and South West of England NQTs struggle to obtain posts and teachers with secure ones are unlikely to risk changing jobs. Milne claims that whilst the number of training places available is based on projections of the number of teachers needed in the future, courses are frequently funded in Northern universities, in areas where there may not be teaching jobs available and a government spokesperson had suggested that NQTs will need to relocate to find jobs. Hobson et al (2007) found that 34% of those NQTs who struggled to find posts stated that this was because there were no posts in their desired locations, although the study does not state which regions this affected.

Johnson's (2003) report looks at issues in London. He asserts that issues there are no different from those faced in other parts of the country, but rather that it is the extent of the problem in London that is different. He describes the 'Capital Teacher' brand: a proposal for actions to specifically attract NQTs and mid-career teachers to work in London schools.

3 Reasons for choosing teaching and teacher training

3.1 Introduction

Barmby's study (2006) looks at why people enter a teaching career, beginning with three reasons offered by Kyriacou and Coulthard in 2000:

- for altruistic reasons, a desire to help children and society and perform a socially worthwhile job;
- for intrinsic reasons, such as the activity of teaching children, the ability to use their subject knowledge or expertise;
- for extrinsic reasons, including aspects of the job unrelated to the actual work, such as the holidays, pay levels or status (Kyriacou and Coulthard, cited in Barmby, 2006).

Studies in this area tend to identify intrinsic and altruistic reasons as the most common ones for choosing a teaching career (Barmby, 2006). Barmby's survey (2006) reinforces this finding, with child-orientated, intrinsic and altruistic reasons being most commonly given: the majority of respondents stated that they had 'always had it (teaching) in mind'. This article also explores literature that considers why people had not chosen teaching as a career, including salary, workload, the status of teaching, stress, bureaucracy, school funding and management and pupil behaviour. Those surveyed who had gone into teaching gave reasons that might have led them to decide not to do so, as pupil behaviour, workload and financial reasons (cost of the training and salary) (Barmby, 2006).

3.2 Initial teacher training

Noyes (2004) suggests that PGCE programmes may not fully equip teachers for their experiences in the classroom. This study indicates that the courses are too short to instil in NQTs the benefits and importance of self-awareness and self-direction as tools for changing their own behaviour.

Parkinson's study of induction also raises concerns about gaps in initial teacher training (ITT) provision, specifically in Secondary PGCE training. Some of the areas where NQTs have difficulties when entering the school environment are dealing with parents and handling difficult behaviour, which Parkinson (2005) suggests could be addressed more thoroughly in PGCE training. This study also identifies a view from NQTs that they would appreciate greater support after completing their PGCE, in addition to their induction. Of those surveyed, 72% of NQTs felt they would like to keep in touch with the HEI where they completed their PGCE, 53% felt it would help them to be in touch with a local HEI and many felt that opportunities to talk to other NQTs and discuss issues would be useful (Parkinson, 2005).

3.3 Employment-based ITT routes

Price and Willett's paper (2006) looks at some of the changes in ITT over recent years. This includes an increasing trend for primary trainees to undertake a PGCE course rather than a more traditional BA or BEd teaching degree, and a dramatic increase in the number of training options based entirely in schools with little or no HEI input. They also discuss the increased importance of schools within the ITT process, now seen less as 'teaching practice' and more as a part of the mentoring and support of trainees. Whilst this places greater pressure on schools, it is also frequently seen as improving standards within the school: NQTs bring new momentum and ideas and encourage reflexive practice in the staff supporting them (Price and Willett, 2006).

Griffiths (2007) looks at experiences from the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP), an employment-based route into teaching. This, set up as a workplace training model in the south of England, was anticipated to appeal to rural schools that would not ordinarily be able to accept trainee teachers because of the distance to universities. Previous experience in schools (as classroom assistants or voluntary helpers, for example) was seen as beneficial to trainees, helping them to cope with the transition to teaching (Griffiths, 2007): however, this also meant in some instances that schools had unrealistic expectations of their abilities. Schools involved in GTP schemes were generally perceived as very supportive of their trainees, professionally and personally (Griffiths, 2007).

Brookes' study (2005) also looks at the GTP, upon which he says opinion is divided. He cites findings indicating that, whilst meeting the minimum criteria, many trainees are failing to meet the higher standards that they are capable of reaching, as a result of inadequacies in the training. However, other evaluations of this programme have praised the opportunities offered to those who would not enter teaching through more traditional routes (Brookes, 2005). The study included a small survey of GTP mentors alongside interviews, which highlighted some uncertainties in the requirements, standards and expected training of GTP trainees. He concludes that whilst there are concerns for standards, this type of training will inevitably become more common in time.

3.4 Not taking up teaching post-training

One recruitment issue is qualified teachers (those who have completed a teaching qualification but not yet undertaken their NQT year) not taking up teaching posts. Bird's study (2002) suggests that the reasons given for not moving into a teaching career are significantly different from reasons given by those teachers who leave teaching without experience of working in schools. Many NQTs felt unsuited to teaching, experienced unsuccessful applications and had concerns around behaviour management.

There is some concern in the literature about NQTs being unable to secure suitable work (e.g. Milne, 2007). However, a recent study for the TDA found that 87% of those contacted post-ITT had successfully found posts (permanent or fixed-term) and 7% were working as supply teachers, meaning that only 6% had been unable to secure a teaching post (Hobson et al 2007).

3.5 Mature entry to teaching

Priyadharshini and Robinson-Pant's study (2003) looks at career changers to teaching, in a study for the TDA. This small, qualitative study picked out 6 'identities' for career changers:

- parents
- successful careerists
- freelancers
- late starters
- serial careerists
- young career changers.

The study looked at pulls and pushes into teaching. Teaching was seen to offer a sociable environment, a 'moral' unselfish career, an opportunity to make a difference to society, financial security and long term employment in a chosen location. Priyadharshini & Robinson-Pant felt that

mature entrants were realistic about the demands of the career, but many experienced frustrations working with children who were not interested or at low educational levels. The move to teaching as a career was attributed to changed perspectives on life and themselves: changed ideals, life experience and increased confidence with maturity. 'Irritants' were identified as factors that may potentially lead to future retention problems; these included shortfalls in training provision, high stress levels, low pay and problems with school culture (Priyadharshini & Robinson-Pant, 2003).

Bird (2003) promotes mature entrants to teaching (and qualified teachers who have left the profession) as a potential solution to the enduring problem of mathematics teaching shortages, but goes on to say that mature trainees are more likely to experience difficulties in finding a post. One reason may be that they are less able to be flexible about the type of post they are seeking, particularly in relation to geographical location. The study highlighted that mature trainees are likely to apply for posts at a later stage for a variety of personal reasons, leaving fewer opportunities. Mature entrants are also seen as more expensive for an employer as they may have previous experience entitling them to a higher salary (Bird, 2002).

4. Induction

4.1 Accessing induction

The ability to access posts offering induction can be problematic for NQTs: 94% of Open University respondents to Bird's survey (2003) had worked initially in a supply post after their training. This study identified supply as a method used by schools to identify suitable individuals and NQTs to identify a suitable post. With the then DfEE guidance preventing more than four terms of supply teaching without induction, this may contribute to some degree of wastage (Bird, 2002).

Hobson et al (2007) found that 88% of NQTs in a teaching post had access to a formal induction programme and almost all of these (99%) were monitored by an induction tutor/mentor. This study found that accessing induction whilst working as a supply teacher can be a major problem for NQTs.

Smethem and Adey (2005) carried out a comparison of pre- and post-compulsory induction experiences of NQTs using a small qualitative study, which identified some key differences between those that had and had not received induction. They found that prior to formal induction, NQTs experienced 'culture shock' on beginning teaching, where they felt they had to be seen to be coping and received little feedback or praise and had heavy workloads. Induction was seen as supporting NQTs to develop more positive relationships with other school staff and offering opportunities for reflection and feedback, despite NQTs still experiencing a heavy workload (Smethem & Adey, 2005). In later research Smethem identifies a clear relationship between the early induction experiences of NQTs and their intentions to remain in teaching (Smethem, 2007).

4.2 Induction standards

Many of the studies on NQT recruitment show concerns around the induction process. Carrington et al's (2001) study for the TDA of ethnic minority teachers, found that many expressed dissatisfaction with their induction. Heilbronn et al (2002) found that the quality of induction is inconsistent even within a school and induction tutors do not always have sufficient experience for the role. Castagnoli and Cook (2004) state that induction programmes and professional development opportunities are two of the main factors for NQTs in choosing schools. Barrington (2000) raises questions about the familiarity of NQTs and induction tutors with the expected NQT standards and about the appropriateness of assessment structures. Jackson (2007) also highlights problems: NQTs feel that they are not valued or listened to and many are afraid to speak up about the way they are treated because of their position within school, particularly if employed on a temporary contract.

Sheffield

Hallam University

SHARPENS YOUR THINKING

Lewis, Mackay & Varley (2000) found that standards of induction were variable for primary NQTs. Their small scale study, involving surveys and interviews, raised questions about target setting, monitoring of standards, the extent to which NQTs actually had reduced teaching time and CPD provided. They found that provision was as mixed as that found by HMI in a study carried out 10 years previously (cited HMI, 1993, *The New Teacher in School*).

Bubb (2006) also gives examples of poor practice in NQT induction, which includes insufficient reduction in timetable, lack of training, lack of consultation with NQTs about targets and standards, no support, and bullying of NQTs by the senior management team.

Parkinson (2005) identifies subject knowledge as a weakness for many secondary NQTs, which should be addressed through their induction. However, where the induction tutor comes from a different subject specialism this does not occur. This study also suggests that NQT mentors may lack knowledge of teacher development strategies such as reflexive practice, so that not only are they unable to support NQTs with this, but it may inadvertently lead to NQTs stagnating or adversely affect their progress (Parkinson, 2005).

Hobson et al's (2007) study of NQTs found that 84% of those who had accessed induction had been recommended to pass and 13% had not yet been informed, with only 3% being aware that they were not being recommended to pass (mostly because they had not been in post long enough).

5 Retention and ongoing professional development

5.1 Introduction

Whilst there are overlapping features, retention issues are separate from those relating to recruitment. There are two primary perspectives from which this has been examined in the literature: the factors that have impacted on teachers to make them leave (or wish to leave) teaching (retention as a problem); the ways in which government/local authorities/schools have tried to improve retention rates (the solution to the problem of retention). Sammons et al (2007) suggest there are two aspects relating to the issue of retention: physical continuation in the role, the way that retention is predominantly defined; and maintenance of motivation and commitment to the role, i.e. the retention of quality, a much more complex issue to both quantify and investigate.

This study found that more advantaged schools experienced better retention in relation to both of these definitions and retention was also better in primary than secondary.

5.2 Intention

Smethem's article looking at retention and intention raises the concern that the conceptions of career and career longevity amongst teachers in their first two years of service are significantly at odds with those of previous generations of teachers (Johnson 2004, cited in Smethem, 2007). Smethem proposes 3 models of teacher in relation to intention:

- the career teacher, committed to a long-term career in teaching with ambition for promotion;
- the portfolio teacher, who sees teaching as a temporary career choice and envisages leaving teaching in the future;
- the classroom teacher, committed to classroom teaching as a long-term career and not actively seeking promotion (Smethem, 2007:470).

Hobson et al (2007) finds that those who report themselves as enjoying working as teachers during their induction year are likely to also report positive relationships with colleagues, pupils, non-teaching staff, parents and the head-teacher and are likely to intend to stay in teaching for at least four years.

5.3 Ongoing professional development

Day et al (2006) argue that teacher effectiveness increases with time, is related to experience rather than age or responsibilities and is supported by a strong teacher identity, continuing professional development (CPD) and positive colleague and peer relationships.

Hodkinson (2006) examines the CEDP (Career Entry Development Profile), used in the NQT induction year as a starting point for CPD. Respondents to the survey on CEDP suggest that this may not provide a positive grounding for future professional development because needs are not met in the first instance: only 5% had their early CPD needs met and 40% had none addressed at all. Nevertheless, the study found that 94% of NQTs were happy with the quality of the in-service training they received in their NQT year (Hodkinson, 2006). Hobson et al (2007) also consider the CEPD and its role as a bridge between the NQT year and future professional development. Around half of respondents to their survey felt that CEPD had helped them to identify strengths and

weaknesses and that it was a useful link between ITT and Induction, although between a quarter and a third did not share this view.

Sammons et al's study (2007) identifies the need for more targeted CPD provision in schools to reflect the needs of teachers at various career stages, and the need for provision that reflects teachers' commitment, resilience and health needs. This was found to support pupil learning and achievement and represents what Sammons et al describe as quality retention.

Bubb and Earley (2006) describe the reasons that prevent teachers, particularly those early in their careers, from undertaking CPD as 'educational vandalism', which is insidious and far-reaching. This, in their view, has various causes: policy changes to remove ring fencing for CPD budgets, poor leadership and management of CPD in schools and teachers themselves, who do not take their personal responsibility for development seriously (Bubb & Earley, 2006). They recommend increased investment, increased emphasis on the CPD coordinator role and viewing the schools as a learning environment for adults as well as children (Bubb & Earley, 2006).

5.4 Leavers

The issue of retention is clouded because there are two main ways in which the profession fails to retain teachers. Some research looks into why teachers are lost from the state sector to the private sector (Green et al, 2008). Other research suggests that part of the retention problem can be attributed to teachers moving in and out of teaching temporarily rather than leaving the profession for good (Bird, 2003). An example of this would be Dadley and Edwards (2007) finding that 'leavers' from religious education (RE) teaching are more frequently women who are leaving to start a family.

The EASC study of teacher recruitment and retention used data from exit surveys in West Sussex to explore teachers leaving after 4 or 5 years in the profession and found that this did not relate to pay levels, despite the cost of housing being a key reason for migration from the area (EASC, 2004).

Dadley and Edwards (2007) study of RE teachers examined the most frequently given reasons for leaving the profession: behaviour, lack of support from senior managers, devaluing of the subject, working with non-subject specialists leading to added pressures and workload (heightened for noncurriculum subjects because of lack of available resources for staff). Although this study looks specifically RE, these findings may be relevant to other subjects.

Barmby (2006) found the most common reasons for considering leaving teaching to be workload and pupil discipline. Support with housing, help with childcare and salary were significantly more problematic for those in London than those in the rest of the country.

Smithers and Robinson (2004) identified that leavers are more likely to be younger or older (i.e. nearing retirement) than from a mid-age range, more likely to be women (this may relate to Bird's, 2003, finding that leavers often move in and out of teaching, and Dadley & Edwards, 2007, finding that this is often related to starting a family), and is more frequent in schools in London, the East and the South East (areas identified by Milne, 2007, as those with the greatest need for teachers) (Smithers & Robinson, 2004).

5.5 Budgetary constraints

Budgetary concerns run through the issues of recruitment and retention. Castagnoli and Cook (2004) highlight head-teachers' need for money to make changes to attract the right people to their schools. Heilbronn et al's (2002) study found that the number of NQTs employed on temporary contracts is increasing. The LSE's research recorded a net flow of 1,400 experienced teachers from the state to the (better resourced) private sector in 2006 (Green et al, 2008). This may be more a result of the increasing demand for private education in Britain, as differences in pay and satisfaction between the private and state sectors is less significant than is generally believed (LSE, 2007).

Budgetary constraints often mean that schools are unable to offer permanent contracts, and instead use fixed-term contracts. This tends to affect NQTs disproportionately (Williams 1997; cited in Bird, 2002). Smithers and Robinson (2004) found that an increasing number of teachers is leaving the profession due to non-renewal of fixed term contracts. Hobson et al (2007) found that secondary school NQTs were more likely to initially secure a permanent post than primary (76% compared to 58%); primary teachers were much more likely to have had difficulty securing a post (32% compared to 12%). Hobson et al's (2007) study further found that 24% of those intending to secure a post at a different school at the end of their NQT year were doing so because their present contract was ending, and the majority of those not intending to teach in the coming year had been unable to find a teaching post (24%).

OECD identifies that starting salaries for teachers in England have risen much faster than midcareer and top-of-the-scale salaries (OEC, 2007).

5.6 Status of teachers

The status of teachers may have some relevance to retention problems. Devaluing of the subject was seen as relating to retention in Dadley and Edwards' (2007) study of RE teachers; devaluation by the school sometimes led to a reduction in budget and also devaluation by colleagues, pupils and parents. Hargreaves et al's study (2007) found that the perception of teachers' status was similar to that of social workers in the eyes of schools' staff and the public. They noted variations in the perception of status between better and poorer performing schools and between some more marginalised groups of teachers (such as BME teachers or those with SEN responsibility). Their study of media coverage perceived a positive and sympathetic representation of teachers generally (Hargreaves et al, 2007).

5.7 Schools in difficult circumstances

Smithers and Robinson (2004) found a move away from schools in more challenging circumstances but this appeared to be turnover (staff moving to other schools) rather than wastage (staff leaving the profession). The continuation stage of this project identified feeling valued and supported as a strong factor in retaining staff (Smithers & Robinson, 2005).

The OECD 2007 edition of *Education at a Glance* identifies that disadvantaged schools, particularly in poorer neighbourhoods or with large proportions of students speaking other languages, are likely to have most trouble attracting teachers and are consequently more likely to employ those with least experience (OECD, 2007). This conflicts with Hobson et al's (2007) finding that 35% of NQTs

surveyed stated that their school was high in the league tables, although 18% felt their school was in challenging circumstances.

Noyes (2004) found that teachers were likely to gravitate towards the types of schools they themselves had attended, particularly in relation to socio-economic status, which raises questions about who will teach mathematics in the schools that are unable to produce maths teachers and about the roots of this trend. In relation to the University of Nottingham trainees who were the subject of the study, 40% of PGCE trainees found jobs with the schools that they attended for their main placement, a position selected for them by PGCE tutors. This leads Noyes to question whether lecturers hold responsibility for the reinforcement of this socio-economic cycle. Although Hobson et al (2007) do not address the socio-economic status of schools, they also found that 32% of NQTs obtain posts in schools in which they have undertaken placements during training.

6 Themes

From the literature on NQT recruitment and retention several themes emerge. These themes may represent key points along the route from considering a teaching career to becoming an established and successful teacher and may represent those points that need to be addressed in considering solutions to the problems of recruitment and retention of high quality NQTs. They are:

- recruitment to teacher training courses (including attracting the right people and being clear who those people are);
- adequacy of preparation provided by ITT, both for the classroom and for wider school roles such as dealing with parents;
- ensuring that, once qualified, NQTs progress to teaching posts and are able to remain in these posts;
- the support NQTs receive during induction and in addition to the induction process;
- the reasons that teachers leave the profession;
- ensuring that retention of teachers is quality retention; that they continue to undertake CPD and to feel engaged with the job;
- attracting those who have left teaching to return to the profession.

7 Questions for the remainder of this study

The following questions might be considered in the three years of this study.

- Do present policies result in attracting the most appropriate people to ITT?
- Are teachers from BA/BEd courses better prepared for classroom management than those who engage in shorter training (e.g. PGCE)?
- Does ITT fail to cover any areas of skills or expertise that NQTs need?
- What do schools expect of NQTs? Do these expectations vary according to the type of ITT (e.g. differences between university-based and workplace training)?
- Are sufficient teaching posts available for ITT graduates in all areas of the country and in all subject areas?
- Are mature entrants to teaching a more 'expensive option' for SLTs?
- Are NQTs familiar with expected NQT standards?
- Are induction tutors familiar with NQT standards?
- Are assessment structures for NQTs appropriate? Are these adhered to?
- Accountability: who is responsible for ensuring NQT entitlements are met?
- Is there sufficient resourcing by Local Authorities of NQT induction?
- Are SLTs committed to appropriate CPD for NQTs?

Peggy Haughton, Joanne Gledhill, Alison Hramiak, Alan Potts, Sue Drew.

October 2008

Bibliography

Barmby, P. (2006) Improving teacher recruitment and retention: the importance of workload and pupil behaviour. *Educational Research*, 48 (3), pp247-265.

Barrington, R. (2000) An investigation into the induction period which considers the perspectives of NQTs and their induction tutors. Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference. Cardiff University: September 7-10.

Bird, E. (2003) To what extent can diversification of routes to qualified teacher status contribute to the supply of mathematics teachers? In *Shortage of mathematics teachers – what progress?* Proceedings of a National Day Conference, pp. 71–106. Milton Keynes: The Open University.

Birks, P. (2000) Improving the Two Rs: LEA Support for Teacher and Headteacher Recruitment and Retention (EMIE Report No.56). Slough: NFER, EMIE.

Bolam, R., McMahon, A., Stoll, L., Thomas, S & Wallace, M (2005) *Creating and sustaining effective professional learning communities*, Nottingham: Department for Education and Skills.

Brookes, W. (2005) The Graduate Teacher Programme in England: mentor training, quality assurance and the findings of inspection. *Journal of In-service Education*, 31 (1), pp 43-62.

Bubb, S & Earley, P. (2006) Induction rites and wrongs: the 'educational vandalism' of new teachers' professional development, *Journal of In-service Education*, 32(1), pp5–12.

Bush, A., Edwards, L., Hopwood Road, F., & Lewis, M. (2005) *Why here? Report of Qualitative Work with Teachers Working in Schools above and below the Floor Targets, Part of the ippr Choice and Equity in Teacher Supply Research Project*, London, Department for Education and Skills.

Carrington, B., Bonnett, A., Demain, J., Hall, I., Nayak, A., Short, G., Skelton, C., Smith, F. & Tomlin, R. (2001) *Ethnicity and the professional socialisation of teachers*. London: Teacher Training Agency.

Castagnoli, P. and Cook, N. (2004) *Growing Your Own Leaders: The impact of professional development on school improvement*, Full Practitioner Report, Nottingham: National College for School Leadership.

Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (2007) Education at a Glance 2007. OECD.

Cunningham, M. & Hargreaves, L. (2007) *Minority ethnic teachers' professional experiences: Evidence from the Teacher Status Project. RR 853* London: DfES.

Dadley, E.M. & Edwards, B. (2007) Where have all the flowers gone? An investigation into the retention of religious education teachers, *British Journal of Religious Education*, 29(3), pp249-271.

Carried out by the Centre for Education and Inclusion Research, PCASO and Primary Subject Groups, Sheffield Hallam University

Day, C., Stobart, G., Sammons, P., Kington, A., Gu, Q., Smees, R., & Mujtaba, T. (2007) *Variations in Teachers' Work, Lives and Their Effects on Pupils: VITAE Report (DfES Research Report 743)*, London, Department for Education and Skills.

Education and the Arts Select Committee (2004) *Teacher Recruitment and Retention Subgroup Report, <u>http://www.westsussex.gov.uk/CS/committee/EDA/EDA090604i6a.pdf</u> last accessed 3rd April 2008.*

Education Data Surveys (2007) <u>http://www.educationdatasurveys.org.uk/?q=node/3</u> last accessed 4th April 2008.

Green, F., Machin, S., Murphy, R., & Zhu, Y. (2008) Competition for Private and State School Teachers, The London School of Economics and Political Science, Paper No' CEEDP0094 http://cee.lse.ac.uk/cee%20dps/ceedp94.pdf last accessed 15th April 2008.

Griffiths, V. (2007) Experiences of training on an employment-based route into teaching in England', *Journal of In-Service Education*, 33 (1), pp107-123.

Hargreaves, L., Cunningham, M., Hansen, A., McIntyre, D., Oliver, C., & Pell, T. (2007) *The Status of Teachers and the Teaching Profession in England: Views from Inside and Outside the Profession. Final Report of the Teacher Status Project.* DfES Research Report, 831A.

Heilbronn, R., Totterdell, M., Bubb, S., & Jones, C. (2002) *The whole school management of induction: central factors for success.* Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the British Educational Research Association. University of Exeter: September 12-14.

Hobson, A.J., Malderez, A., Tracey, L., Homer, M., Mitchell, N., Biddulph, M., Giannakaki, M.S., Rose, A., Pell, R.G., Roper, T., Chambers, G.N., & Tomlinson, P.D. (2007) *Newly Qualified Teachers' experiences of their first year of teaching: Findings from Phase III of the 'Becoming a teacher' project*, London, Department for Education and Skills.

Hodkinson, A. (2006) Career Entry Development Profiles and the statutory induction arrangements in England: a model of effective practice for the professional development of Newly Qualified Teachers?, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 32(3), pp.287-300.

Hustler, D., McNamara, O., Jarvis, J., Londra, M., Campbell, A., & Howson, J. (2003) *Teachers Perceptions of Continuing Professional Development, DfES Research Brief* 429: London, DfES.

Jackson, A. (2007) The development of questioning as an enrichment to the professionalism of beginning teachers. Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference. Institute of Education: University of London: September 5-8.

Johnson, M (2003) Schooling in London: An overview. Institute for Public Policy Research.

Lewis, P., MacKay, S., & Varley, S. (2000) *Monitoring the induction experience of newly qualified teachers. Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference.* Cardiff University: September 7-10.

LSE (2007) New research on independent schools-their effects on teacher supply and the returns to private education

www.lse.ac.uk/collections/pressAndInformationOffice/newsAndEvents/archives/2008/IndependentS choolsResearch.htm last accessed 3rd April 2008.

Milne, J. (2007) *North-south divide in teachers' jobs.* The Times Educational Supplement, August 17th p9.

Moor, H., Halsey, K., Jones, M., Martin, K., Stott, A., Brown, C. & Harland, J. (2005) *Professional Development for Teachers Early in their Careers: an Evaluation of the Early Professional Development Pilot Scheme* (DfES Research Report 613). London: DfES.

Morton, R. (2002) Hellos and Handcuffs: *LEA Support for Teacher and Headteacher Recruitment and Retention (EMIE Report No. 67).* Slough: NFER, EMIE.

Noyes, A., (2004) Where have all the maths teachers gone? *Proceedings of the British Society for Research into the Learning of Mathematics 24 (3),* pp21-26.

OECD, (2005) Teachers matter: Attracting, developing and retaining teachers, Paris, OECD.

Parkinson, J. & Pritchard, J. (2005) The Induction experiences of newly qualified secondary teachers in England and Wales. *Journal of In-service Education*, 31(1), pp 63-81.

Powney, J., Wilson, V., Hall, S., Davidson, J., Kirk, S., Edward, S., Mirza, H.S. (2003), *Teachers' Careers: The Impact of Age, Disability, Ethnicity, Gender and Sexual Orientation,* London, Department for Education and Skills.

Price, A. & Willett, J. (2006) Primary teachers' perceptions of the impact of initial teacher training upon primary schools. *Journal of In-service education*, 32(1), pp33-45.

Priyadharshini, E. & Robinson-Pant, A. (2003) The attractions of teaching: an investigation into why people change careers to teach, *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 29(2), pp.95-112.

Purcell, K., Wilton, N., Davies, R., & Elias, P. (2005) *Education as a graduate career: entry and exit from teaching as a profession.* London: Department for Education and Skills.

Sammons, P., Day, C., Kington, A., Gu, Q., Stobart, G. & Smees, R. (2007) Exploring variations in teachers' work, lives and their effects on pupils: key findings and implications from a longitudinal mixed-method study, *British Educational Research Journal - Special Issue*, 33(5), 681-701.

Smethem, L. & Adey, K. (2005) Some effects of statutory induction on the professional development of newly qualified teachers: a comparative study of pre- and post-induction experiences. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 31(3), pp187-200.

Smethem, L. (2007) Retention and intention in teaching careers: will the new generation stay?. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 13(5), pp465-480.

Smithers, A. & Robinson, P. (2003) *Factors affecting teachers' decisions to leave the profession,* Nottingham, Department for Education and Skills.

Smithers, A. & Robinson, P. (2004) *Teacher turnover, wastage and destinations,* Nottingham, Department for Education and Skills.

Smithers, A. & Robinson, P. (2005) *Teacher turnover, wastage and movements between schools*, Nottingham, Department for Education and Skills.

Training and Development Agency for Schools (2006). A political history of the challenges faced by the government in improving teacher training provision in England: 1990 - 2005. London: TDA.

Totterdell, M., Woodroffe, L., Bubb, S. & Hanrahan, K. (2004) *The impact of NQT induction* programmes on the enhancement of teacher expertise, professional development, job satisfaction or retention rates: a systematic review of research on induction. London: Institute of Education.

Tranter, S. (2003) *Talent Spotting: Recognising and developing leadership potential.* Nottingham: National College for School Leadership.

Wilson, P., Hopwood, V., & Antill, M. (2005) *Recruitment and Retention in the Post-16 Learning and Skills Sector,* London, Department for Education and Skills.